

PATENT COOPERATION TREATY  
PCT

REC'D 24 AUG 2005  
WIPO PCT

INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT ON PATENTABILITY

(Chapter II of the Patent Cooperation Treaty)

(PCT Article 36 and Rule 70)

Applicant's or agent's file reference 11321P075WO	FOR FURTHER ACTION See Form PCT/APEA/416	
International application No. PCT/US2004/028603	International filing date (day/month/year) 02.09.2004	Priority date (day/month/year) 05.09.2003
International Patent Classification (IPC) or national classification and IPC C09D11/00		
<p>Applicant WILLIAM MARSH RICE UNIVERSITY et al</p> <p>1. This report is the International preliminary examination report, established by this International Preliminary Examining Authority under Article 35 and transmitted to the applicant according to Article 36.</p> <p>2. This REPORT consists of a total of 4 sheets, including this cover sheet.</p> <p>3. This report is also accompanied by ANNEXES, comprising:</p> <p>a. <input type="checkbox"/> sent to the applicant and to the International Bureau a total of sheets, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> sheets of the description, claims and/or drawings which have been amended and are the basis of this report and/or sheets containing rectifications authorized by this Authority (see Rule 70.16 and Section 607 of the Administrative Instructions).</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> sheets which supersede earlier sheets, but which this Authority considers contain an amendment that goes beyond the disclosure in the international application as filed, as indicated in item 4 of Box No. I and the Supplemental Box.</li> </ul> <p>b. <input type="checkbox"/> (sent to the International Bureau only) a total of (indicate type and number of electronic carrier(s)), containing a sequence listing and/or tables related thereto, in computer readable form only, as indicated in the Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing (see Section 802 of the Administrative Instructions).</p> <p>4. This report contains indications relating to the following items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. I Basis of the opinion</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. II Priority</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. III Non-establishment of opinion with regard to novelty, inventive step and industrial applicability</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. IV Lack of unity of invention</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. V Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VI Certain documents cited</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Box No. VII Certain defects in the international application</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application</li> </ul>		
Date of submission of the demand 30.03.2005	Date of completion of this report 23.08.2005	
Name and mailing address of the International preliminary examining authority:   European Patent Office D-80298 Munich Tel. +49 89 2399 - 0 Tx: 523656 epmu d Fax: +49 89 2399 - 4465	Authorized Officer  Von Kuzenko, M Telephone No. +49 89 2399- 	

---

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT  
ON PATENTABILITY**

---

International application No.  
PCT/US2004/028603

---

**Box No. I Basis of the report**

---

1. With regard to the language, this report is based on the international application in the language in which it was filed, unless otherwise indicated under this item.
  - This report is based on translations from the original language into the following language, which is the language of a translation furnished for the purposes of:
    - international search (under Rules 12.3 and 23.1(b))
    - publication of the international application (under Rule 12.4)
    - international preliminary examination (under Rules 55.2 and/or 55.3)
2. With regard to the elements\* of the international application, this report is based on (*replacement sheets which have been furnished to the receiving Office in response to an invitation under Article 14 are referred to in this report as "originally filed" and are not annexed to this report*):

**Description, Pages**

1-18 as originally filed

**Claims, Numbers**

1-75 as originally filed

**Drawings, Sheets**

15-55 as originally filed

- a sequence listing and/or any related table(s) - see Supplemental Box Relating to Sequence Listing

- The amendments have resulted in the cancellation of:
  - the description, pages
  - the claims, Nos.
  - the drawings, sheets/figs
  - the sequence listing (*specify*):
  - any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*):
- This report has been established as if (some of) the amendments annexed to this report and listed below had not been made, since they have been considered to go beyond the disclosure as filed, as indicated in the Supplemental Box (Rule 70.2(c)).
  - the description, pages
  - the claims, Nos.
  - the drawings, sheets/figs
  - the sequence listing (*specify*):
  - any table(s) related to sequence listing (*specify*):

\* If item 4 applies, some or all of these sheets may be marked "superseded."

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY REPORT  
ON PATENTABILITY**

International application No.  
PCT/US2004/028603

**Box No. V Reasoned statement under Article 35(2) with regard to novelty, inventive step or industrial applicability; citations and explanations supporting such statement**

**1. Statement**

Novelty (N)	Yes: Claims	31-75
	No: Claims	1-30
Inventive step (IS)	Yes: Claims	31-75
	No: Claims	1-30
Industrial applicability (IA)	Yes: Claims	1-75
	No: Claims	

**2. Citations and explanations (Rule 70.7):**

**see separate sheet**

**Box No. VIII Certain observations on the international application**

The following observations on the clarity of the claims, description, and drawings or on the question whether the claims are fully supported by the description, are made:

**see separate sheet**

**INTERNATIONAL PRELIMINARY  
REPORT ON PATENTABILITY  
(SEPARATE SHEET)**

International application No.

PCT/US2004/028603

D1: PATENT ABSTRACTS OF JAPAN vol. 2003, no. 05, 12 May 2003 (2003-05-12) & JP 2003 026981 A (TOHOKU RICOH CO LTD), 29 January 2003  
D2: EP-A-1 020 888 (MATSUSHITA ELECTRONICS CORPORATION) 19 July 2000  
D3: US-B1-6 330 939 (PRATT GEORGE W) 18 December 2001

**cf V**

1. Claim 1 is a product claim. It discloses an ink comprising a suspension of carbon nanotubes.  
Such inks are known from the disclosure of D1, D2 and D3.  
Therefore the subject-matter of claim 1 does not meet the requirements of Art. 33(2) PCT.  
Similar considerations apply to claims 11 and 19.
2. A method to use inks comprising carbon nanotubes for marking and security purposes is not disclosed in the prior art.  
This method is also not derivable from the prior art teaching.  
Hence the subject-matter of claims 31 and 41 meet the requirements of Articles 33(2) and 33(3) PCT.

**cf VIII**

1. The subject-matter of claim 1 is partly characterized by results to be achieved (see for instance terms like "are operable for undergoing", "yielding emission within a pre-determined range of wavelengths" or "the nanotube ink is formulated for adhesion").  
This is not allowable according to Art. 6 PCT.  
Similar considerations apply to claims 11 and 19.